

‘INFLAMING INFIRMITY’: SOME MEDICAL-LITERARY INTERFACES OF 19TH CENTURY TUBERCULOSIS*

Catherine Moloney

Whilst meagre phthisis gives a silent blow:
Her strokes are sure but her advances slow.
No loud alarms no fierce assaults are shown.
She starves the fortress first, then takes the town.¹

It is unusual to begin an article about disease with a verse of poetry, but it is my purpose to highlight the synergy between literature and medicine in the nineteenth century. As Professor Michael Shepherd commented (in his 1984 Squibb History of Psychiatry Lecture), ‘most physicians, and all psychiatrists, can benefit professionally from some familiarity with the world of fiction. The works of Shakespeare, Balzac, Dickens, Ibsen ... depict morbid states of mind encountered in clinical practice [and] they illustrate and often supersede most text-books.’² This article aims to minister to that professional benefit by focussing on a specific period, the nineteenth century, and a particular disease, tuberculosis.

The term tuberculosis was first used, in about 1830, by the *Naturhistoriker* Johann Schonlein but it was not until the twentieth century that it became the accepted label for morbid disease of the lungs caused by the tubercle bacillus. In the later nineteenth century, the terms ‘phthisis’, ‘tuberculosis’ and ‘consumption’ were used indiscriminately in both popular and medical writings. ‘Phthisis’ was, however, regarded as the particular clinical term and

* This is a revised version of the illustrated paper which was given to the Society on 8 November 2001.

1 Samuel Garth 1661-1719, as cited in John Bessner Huber, *Consumption: Its relation to Man and his Civilisation* (Philadelphia and London: Lippincot, 1906), p.17. Huber was prominent in the ‘American Crusade Against Tuberculosis’. See pp.197–98 for a portrayal of physician and consumptive patient in terms curiously reminiscent of those applied by Henry James to the relationship of Sir Luke Strett and Milly Theale in *The Wings of the Dove*. The physician has the ‘generalship’ while the female patient is to act like an obedient volunteer soldier.

2 Institute of Psychiatry, London, June 1984. See Michael Shepherd, *Sherlock Holmes and the Case of Doctor Freud* (London and New York: Tavistock, 1985), p.7.

'consumption' as the generic description, with the acute stage of the disease commonly referred to as 'galloping consumption'. Hence, popular magazines of the 1880s could report: 'We are all of us, unfortunately, familiar with the symptoms of that disease which the unlearned know by the name of consumption, and the scientific prefer to call by the Greek equivalent phthisis.'³ And: 'The lung disease, known among medical men as phthisis pulmonalis and otherwise as consumption is a condition resulting in a gradual wasting away ... slowly ... [but] not too painfully towards death.'⁴

My analysis of 'Victorian' medical and literary texts predicates the 'fetishisation' of tuberculosis, with all its allegorical intimations in both narrative and clinical settings. Examination of the pseudo-mystical cachet of lung disease is in keeping with the Victorians' principle of 'One Culture', a principle in terms of which they attempted to conflate, while accommodating, the discrete disciplines of Art, Science, Medicine and Letters. The aesthetic, social, moral, ethical and medical attitudes generated by the literary interplay of these disciplines made 'meagre phthisis' a rich source of inspiration for certain writers who latterly linked this wasting disease with such negative epiphenomena as sexual deviancy, metropolitan vice and neurasthenia. Yet, paradoxically, the disease had been earlier associated with an ascribed ethereal other-worldliness in the sufferer, a state of nature that provided novelists with intriguing sub-plots of redemptive asceticism.

The same medico-literary interfaces are not without contemporary resonance, partly because modern chroniclers of the 'White Plague' have rekindled interest in the correlation of physical disease with debilitating depravity. Thus, doctors and writers engaged in the great debates about AIDS are re-enacting the psycho-dramas and patho-dramas of purgation, mortification and hedonistic wasting long associated with '*Spes Phthisica*', the real or imagined euphoria accompanying morbid lung pathology.

In the social and literary history of medicine there has often been a middle ground between writers whose approach is clinical, technical and scientific, and others whose style is populist, folkloric and journalistic. This normative middle ground has particular significance in areas where literature, medicine and religion overlap — as, for example, in the ministries of healing, divination, therapeutics and holism, and in public interest in psychosomatic disorders and the purported exercise of vestigial remains of preternatural gifts.⁵ Victorian medical professionals with a literary bent, and likewise their journalist

3 *Month and Catholic Review*, 38 (1880), 285-86.

4 *Chambers Journal*, (30 July 1881), 489.

5 For an extensive bibliography, see the anthology: *Understanding Mysticism*, ed. by Richard Woods (London: Athlone, 1980). Note the interesting contribution from William James.

chroniclers with medical pretensions, stirred the resultant cultural pot-pourri — in order to popularise a mystique of the cultivation of forces manifesting themselves as the symptoms of ‘Wasting Hope’, forces spiritual yet sexual, euphoric yet depraving, exalting yet enervating. This middle ground between literature and medicine could also be a battle-ground, involving many eminent Victorians, for instance, Disraeli, who though himself a popular novelist, issued the political clarion call of ‘*Sanitas sanitatum omnia sanitas!*’⁶ Another tactician of this cultural battle-ground was Sir William Osler, when he prophetically asserted that consumption ‘will never be drummed out of the Regiment.’⁷ (Much earlier, Richard Morton, in his 1694 *Phthisiologia*, had claimed that it was hard to believe that anyone could reach maturity without being touched by consumption.)⁸ In such allegorical language as Osler’s, descriptions of the affliction abound. As early as 1672, both the mystical cachet and doom-laden curse had been hinted at by Gideon Harvey when discussing consumption and related disorders in his *Morbus Anglicus*: ‘Physicians do extraordinarily hallucinate [sic] in the discern of the causes’⁹ Eighteenth and nineteenth-century phthisiologists like Benjamin Marten, James Edward Pollock and Edward Smith were intrigued by the unpredictable progressions and remissions of tuberculosis and its apparent links with hereditary and genetic, as well as moral and constitutional, predispositions.¹⁰

In 1802, in his *Hygeia*, Thomas Beddoes gave clear warning of the peril of the disease. ‘Though consumption have not been on either side, the chance without an anti-phthisical regimen is still bad. Two or three colds in Winter ... will do the business; and in the meantime there shall be wretched health ... [Hence,] when a son or daughter droops between fourteen and thirty-four suspect that a secret enemy is sapping the lungs.’¹¹ Beddoes railed against a

6 C.P. Hill, *British Economic and Social History 1700-1892* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1985), p.195.

7 Cited in H. De Carle Woodcock, *The Doctor and the People* (London: Methuen, 1912), p.209.

8 Richard Morton, *Phthisiologia: Or a Treatise of Consumption* (London: Smith and Watford, 1694), p.88.

9 Gideon Harvey, *A Theoretick and Practical Discourse of Consumption and Hypochondriack Melancholy* (London: William Thackeray, 1672), p.75.

10 Benjamin Marten, *A New Theory of Consumption* (London: Knaplock, Bell, Hook and King, 1720), pp.13, 34; James Edward Pollock, *The Elements of Prognosis in Consumption* (London: Longmans, 1875), p.70; Edward Smith, *British Medical Journal*, (1857), 70.

11 Thomas Beddoes, *Hygeia* (Bristol: 1802), p.94. For a full biography of Beddoes see Roy Porter, *Doctor of Society: Thomas Beddoes And The Sick Trade In Late-Enlightenment England* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992); Dorothy A. Stansfield, *Thomas Beddoes*

current explanation of failing health, 'the frequent perusal of melting love-stories related in novels.' He even went so far as to condemn romantic lyricism in words of romantic lyricism:¹²

Writers of romance exhibit the slow decline of the consumptive as a state on which the fancy may agreeably repose and in which not much more misery is felt than by a blossom nipped by untimely frosts.

Three-quarters of a century later, the great Sir James Paget was to lament the consequences of ignoring Beddoes' warnings:¹³

Many die whose maladies have been made light of, and called with a sneer 'hysterical' or 'only nervous' or the like. They die, and often die young, not only through their nervous malady but through tuberculosis ... which they have inherited and which their invalid habits have made it impossible to avert.

Similarly, four years later, in 1879, the *Family Physician* warned that: 'People whose general health is below par are the most likely to become the subjects of consumption.'¹⁴ Yet at the end of the century, Benjamin Ward Richardson, a pulmonary specialist and polymath author of the *Asclepiad*, was still inveighing against romantic fiction, whilst advocating laughter as the best medicine. '[Avoid] exciting romances ... with the narrations of deep and fiendish plots and hyper-poetic sentiments... [Instead, choose] the book which with easy effort, raises the hearty laugh.'¹⁵ By his time, consumption was widely understood to be both invidious and insidious; epidemic in character and

Continued ...

M.D. 1760-1808, Chemist, Physician, Democrat (Lancaster, Germany: Reidel Dordrecht, 1984).

12 Thomas Beddoes, *Essay on the Causes, Early Signs, and Prevention of Pulmonary Consumption for the Use of Parents and Preceptors* (Bristol: Biggs and Cottle, 1799), pp. 6, 121. See also Jan Golinski, *Science as Public Culture: Chemistry and Enlightenment in Britain, 1760-1820* (Cambridge: CUP, 1992); *The Sciences in Enlightened Europe*, ed. by William Clark, Jan Golinski and Simon Schaffer (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1999).

13 Sir James Paget, *Clinical Lectures and Essays* (London: Longmans, 1875), p.188.

14 *The Family Physician: A Manual of Domestic Medicine by Physicians and Surgeons of the Principal London Hospitals* (London, Paris and New York: Cassell, Petter and Galpin, 1879), p. 194.

15 Benjamin Ward Richardson, *The Hygienic Treatment of Pulmonary Consumption in the Asclepiad. A Book of Original Research and Observation in the Science, Art and Literature of Medicine: Preventative and Curative* (London: Longmans, n.d.), vol. 11, p. 122. See also the Obituary Notice in the *Transactions of the Epidemiological Society of London*, n.s. 16(1896-97), 289-93. Yet Richardson's own inability to subject his imagination to a curb of sufficient strength was publicly lamented by his colleagues.

deadly in effect. Indeed, it had come to be used as a synonym for the Grim Reaper, whose haunting presence literate Victorians learned to fear from the apocalyptic alexandrine of Edmund Spenser's *Faerie Queene*: 'Lo, Where the Dreadful Death behind thy back doth stand.'

The 'Romantic' View of tuberculosis

An epidemic of tuberculosis — 'the Captain of the men of death' in John Bunyan's phrase — coincided with the Industrial Revolution in Britain. In the nineteenth century, it caused (as far as can be ascertained from contemporary statistics) as many as one in seven of all recorded Victorian adult deaths and to this extent was more devastating than cholera or smallpox. Despite its horrors, it became fetishised, because the tragic early deaths of young artists, writers, composers and musicians encouraged the myth that it was causally related to creative genius. For example, the publicity surrounding the brief and tragic life of John Keats encouraged a romantic view of his disease and of its perceived medical mismanagement.¹⁶ The creation of the myth and fetish of '*spes phthisica*' was partly a defence mechanism against the widely-publicised protracted agonies caused by the disease and its treatments, and partly a response to the cult of the emotions fostered by some of the followers of the Romantic Movement. These Romantics categorised lung disease as an epiphenomenon of the 'Energy of Illness'. They accorded it quasi-mystical status in an etiological narrative — almost a strip-tease — which pared away the flesh and exposed the spirit, to reveal incandescent transparency, hectic febrility, languid delicacy and emaciate glow, in a litany of virtuous though at times libidinal suffering, such, for instance, as that advocated by Dante Gabriel Rossetti's 'Seraph-Seductress', Elizabeth Siddall.

The allure of this 'dance-of-the-seven-symptoms', with often erotic concomitants, generated much Victorian fictional death-bed drama, from that of Charles Dickens' Paul Dombey to Louisa M. Alcott's Beth March. Hence, the following comment by Mark Caldwell:¹⁷

[Such scenes] often cause an unsettling satisfaction, as if the invalid's death were not merely satisfying to the observer or self-satisfaction in the survivor, but an erotic frisson. The spectacle of the victim revealing more and more through ever more diaphanous veils of flesh, arouses the keeper of the bedside vigil even as the consumptive's weakness and passivity put her more and more within his power.

The most important 'keeper of the bedside vigil' was the doctor. The

16 *The Poems of John Keats*, ed. by Miriam Allott (London: Longmans, 1970), p.xxii; Andrew Motion, *Keats* (London: Faber, 1997).

17 Mark Caldwell, *The Last Crusade: The War on Consumption 1862-1945* (New York: Athenaeum, 1988), p.24.

melodrama of the patient, as a sick Salome, and the physician, as a scientific Svengali, was repeatedly played out in the novels of George Eliot, Henry James and lesser writers as well as in the popular magazines.¹⁸

While the world of imaginative creation allied itself with a cohort of consumptive creative geniuses – Chopin, the Brontes, Rossetti, Poe, Stevenson – whose lives were haunted by the toxic precocity of fashionable wasting, the physicians wrote up their case histories in lyrical terms. Some still do. In 1940, Lewis J. Moorman of the University of Chicago, in his *Tuberculosis and Genius*, wrote:¹⁹

There seems to be a strange psychological flair ... not fully accounted for ... not of established scientific lineage, yet quite evident ... How patiently they bear their lengthening burdens, how courageous they are in the face of insurmountable obstacles; how optimistic ... when life is literally being cut down by the Grim Reaper ... This courage and hopefulness has been called *Spes Phthisica*.

Medicalisation of tuberculosis

Nineteenth-century physicians were frequently fascinated by the rhythms of consumption, as well as by its latency, opacity and chronicity. Sir James Clark announced in the *Cyclopaedia of Practical Medicine*,²⁰

The truth is that in the highly tuberculous constitution, tuberculosis disease of the lungs very often occurs in a slow insidious manner ... [and] has made considerable progress before it manifests itself by any remarkable symptoms, or is even suspected to exist by those who regard consumption as originating in inflammatory diseases of the lungs.

The phrase 'by those who regard consumption' is a foretaste of the Victorian diagnostic hedging and fudging by doctors enmeshed in contradictory theories about the false hopes, treacherous relapses and baffling remissions in patients whose consumption appeared to subsume various other afflictions of mind and body. The same morbid fascination appeared regularly, throughout the century, in periodicals like the *Popular Science Monthly* or the *Foreign Quarterly Review*. The latter sprinkled its copy with phrases such as 'The patient is more or less a valetudinarian', while the former repeatedly echoed the bafflement implicit in that 'more or less'. Bafflement, however, had never prevented the

18 Leon Edel, *The Life of Henry James* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1977); Gordon S. Haight, *George Eliot: A Biography* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1985).

19 Lewis J. Moorman MD, *Tuberculosis and Genius* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1940), p. x.

20 Sir James Clark, 'Tubercular Phthisis, or Consumption, Phthisis Tuberculosa, Phthisis Pulmonaris' in *The Cyclopaedia of Practical Medicine*, ed. by John Forbes, Alexander Tweedie and John Conolly, 4 vols (London: Sherwood, Gilbert and Piper, 1833-35), iv, 269.

journalists from pontificating and moralising. Thus, for example, one Andral in the *Foreign Quarterly Review*:²¹

Circumstances of a nature to reduce the strength and perhaps ... affect the nervous system, may bring a healthy individual into that state in which tubercles may be formed in the lungs ... symptoms of consumption appear not long after a patient has struggled through a fever ... induced by a course of reckless dissipation ... [But] lingering in its course ... it exhibits fluctuations which encourage hope, and is sometimes simulated by such general disorder of the health as is curable by great attention to diet and regimen.

The popular narrative inter-play between experts and laymen created a 'wasting zeitgeist' quite unlike the dread of typhus, cholera or smallpox. Not only was the narrative potential of consumption exploited by writers, it was also used by politicians. Though in drawing-room society it was recognised as stealthily-stalking and normatively-debilitating, it provided useful propaganda for those intent on 'gentling the masses' through the cult of '*mens sana in corpore sano*.' It could, after all, be claimed to have redeeming, ennobling, uplifting, even sanctifying side-effects; especially in sufferers who strove to eschew all harmful, intemperate, urban and fashionable dissipations and self-indulgences. The moral crusaders gained support for their ethical holism from the writings of medical authors, especially Beddoes, whose *Hygeia* incarnated a host of satellite etiologies from the catarrhal to the cancerous, and from the psychological to the syphilitic, alongside moral strictures ranging in tone and content from the nearly scatological to the almost eschatological. Beddoes admonished a phthisical family in which 'vanity was the ruling principle' to the effect that,²²

Our taste must be corrected. We must learn not to have about us things ... all exquisite in their kinds, except our progeny. We must be shocked at seeing under the same roof perfect representations of the human figure in contrast with the most wretched realities.

Later, in his *Essay on the Causes of Pulmonary Consumption*, he advocated a hardy rural primitivism which he called 'Philosophical Horticulture' and which he claimed would have '*Spes Phthisica*' as a necessary side-effect.²³

In some of the hectoring by Beddoes, there are distinct echoes of the outraged intensity with which Harvey had written, a century and a half earlier,

21 Andral, 'On Consumption', *Foreign Quarterly Review*, 7(1831), 53-59; cf. *Popular Science Monthly*, 50(1896-97), 338-39.

22 Beddoes, *Hygeia*, pp. 10-17.

23 Beddoes, *Essay*, p. 192.

that 'Consumptives in this degree entertain their visitors with rambling discourses of their intent of going here or there or doing this or that, as if they did in no wise expect to change their dwellings into a grave.'²⁴ Half a century on, in 1720, Marten had generalised that,²⁵

Consumptives are generally observed to be quick, full of spirit ... and of sharp ready wit ... impatient ... tenacious of the least disrespect shown to them ... they talk very well ... they use their Faculty far too much for their own advantage in point of health ... but that only ingenious men can be seized by this distemper cannot be said, though it is certain we do not often meet with dull, heavy persons or such as are slow of speech afflicted with this disease.

In similar vein, Thomas Sydenham wrote, 'When the cough has continued for a long time, then the patient begins to sweat at night ... the first sign of consumption coming on, after this ... a hectic heat ... the patient has all the while a serenity of mind and flatters himself with an opinion of recovery which is usual in this disease even to the very last.'²⁶ In the 1830s William Buchan stated that,²⁷

[The phthisical] habit of body is frequently accompanied by superior powers of mind. Individuals who seem almost to approach the perfection of our species, are peculiarly marked out as the victims of pulmonary consumption ... attended by a precocity of intellect which it is of more importance to check than to encourage.

Since medical professionals believed that their patients were luxuriating in the euphoric glow of 'superior powers', it is scarcely surprising that romantic novelists were eager to probe beneath the valetudinarian masks to lay bare the grim reality, memorably expressed by Dickens in *Nicholas Nickleby*: 'Death takes the glow and fire of life and life the gaunt and grisly form of death.'²⁸

24 Harvey, *Discourse*, pp. 176-77.

25 Marten, *New Theory*, p. 5.

26 Thomas Sydenham, *De Phthisis*, p. 26.

27 William Buchan, *Domestic Medicine or a Treatise on the Prevention and Cure of Diseases*, 22nd English edn (Exeter: J. and B. Williams, 1832), pp.163-64.

28 Charles Dickens, *The Life and Adventures of Nicholas Nickleby* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1848), p. 383.

Conflicting paradigms of phthisis

Literary and scientific rivalry lay at the root of the curious cultural anomaly whereby a superstitious pre-antibiotic view of consumption persisted long after its bacteriological origins had been accepted. The romantic phase of the disease's historical trajectory overlapped the clinical, hygienic, bacteriological discoveries until well into the twentieth century. Only slowly did the morbid romantic patina of the affliction give way to a general acceptance of the harsh reality that tuberculosis is a contagious disease of the masses, like cholera, smallpox and scarlet fever. The persistence of the romantic aura was encouraged by medical writers, in sermonising purple prose. For instance, John Francis Churchill wrote in 1875, 'Those whom heaven seems to have endowed with the seeds of all that is most noble and elevated in the head or in the heart of man are most likely to fall victim to this fell disease.'²⁹

Yet, at the same time, the former adherents of the cult of wasting invalidism began to link the disease with societal anomie, mental deficiency, degenerate lack of moral fibre, spiritual accedia, fecklessness and psychological disturbance. This growing hostility to the idolising of the consumptive as a romantic icon was linked to scientific and medical advances, and to the bio-medical pessimism encouraged by emergent eugenicist philosophies. Consumption was increasingly associated with alcoholism, idiocy and syphilis as a 'transgressive' disease. Its victims were seen as the rotten fruit of a vitiated stock, because allegedly bred in metropolitan squalor. The popular scientific agenda had been taken over by positivist scientists such as T.H. Huxley, the evolutionist, Francis Galton, the ethnologist, Jacques Joseph Moreau de Tours, the neurologist, and Cesare Lombroso, the neuro-phrenologist. Nevertheless, despite the swing in the general perception of the disease away from that of a dominant element of purifying emaciation towards that of putrefying degradation, there were still medical writers who continued to promote the notion that consumption endowed sufferers with quasi-mystical qualities. The physicians' texts had become the repositories of the older metaphorical romantic tradition, now subsumed into new processes of diagnosis and treatment, which claimed to minister to minds as well as to bodies, to psyche as well as to soma. Hence, seventeen years after the discovery of the tubercle bacillus by Robert Koch in 1882, Sir Benjamin Ward Richardson was still able to fulminate, 'This insane hunt for the tubercle bacillus ... is the insanest crusade ever instituted on illogical lines.'³⁰

However, by 1912 the romance of phthisis was being derided, albeit still

29 John Francis Churchill, *Consumption and Tuberculosis* (London: Longmans, 1875), p. 262.

30 For 'phthisiophobia' in general see the *British Medical Journal*, 21(1910), 1243.

lyrically, by Herbert De Carle Woodcock, in his *The Doctor and the People*:³¹

this persistent though inconstant lover ... [with a] rake's progress ... is far worse than leprosy, yet people have shrunk from leprosy and smile at tubercle ... it has even been treated as poetic: the Queen of the May dies of consumption ... and the poet secures immortality ... Such a view is wrong. Tubercle is a coarse common disease, bred in foul breath, in dirt, in squalor.

Despite this assault on sentiment, the persisting popularity of the works of certain romantic authors has resulted in the continuance, even to the present day, of a dualist view of phthisis, seen as elevating sense and sensibility, even when mired in turpitude and depravity. Moorman, a twentieth-century phthisiologist, had to accept this anomalous duality, and did so by postulating a phthisical 'Secondary Personality.'³² In the 1930s the consumptive Katherine Mansfield wrote to a physician fellow sufferer, in plaintive wonder, of her 'Strange joyousness, the faint glitter on the plant that frost has laid a finger on.'³³ This is much the same mode of transformative language as that of the Victorian writers in whose tales demons of madness, eccentricity and depravity were transmogrified into, if not effectively exorcised out of, 'Golden Child Victims'. Thus, in 1854, the *Lancet* had described such as 'pale and prematurely wise, exhaling like the early dew before the morning sun.'³⁴ By 1879, the *Family Physician* was waxing lyrical about 'the favourite little heroes and heroines of the novelists, who appear like fairies to gladden the hearts of parents and friends for a short season; whom the gods love and who die young.'³⁵ But late-Victorian writers and physicians were instead beginning to view consumptives as somehow akin to the rotting lunatics in Bedlam, since they considered creative genius to be inherently self-destructive. These conflicting paradigms of phthisis were explored in both the psychodramas of the fiction

31 De Carle Woodcock, *Doctor and People*, pp. 186-89. For 'folkloric' see *Popular Science Monthly*, 23(May-Dec 1883), 1-12; *Nineteenth Century*, 46(July-Dec.1899), 642-44; *Chambers Journal*, 6th series, 2(Dec 1898-Nov 1899), 134-38. See also Arthur Ransome waxing lyrical about 'air sewage' in *Lancet*, 1(1896), 16.

32 Moorman, *Genius*, pp.376-77.

33 See Mary Burgan, *Illness, Gender and Writing: The Case of Katharine Mansfield* (Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1994). Mansfield's trust in her physicians rested on their qualities of sympathy and 'narrative' insight. She was awed by her first doctor because he read Tolstoy! Burgan examines the way in which Mansfield's experience of *spes phthisica* affected her life, and takes her short story 'Je ne parle pas Français' as an example of the 'mode of interior wariness' (p. 129) that was the legacy of her disease.

34 *Lancet*, 2(1854), 46-47.

35 *Family Physician*, 58(1879), 61.

writers and the patho-dramas of such medical experts as Thomas Clouston.³⁶ They resonated most loudly in the concerns over ‘passions of the mind’, especially those interwoven with sexual frustrations.³⁷

A striking example of medico-literary interfacing was the prurient interest of Victorian phthisiologists in Laënnec’s case-study of a Paris nunnery where the repressive regimen of athletic asceticism erupted in an epidemic of consumption. The lasting voyeuristic appeal of such patho-dramas is shown by the fact that a similar episode at the convent of Loudun was successively turned into a novel: *The Devils of Loudun*, by Aldous Huxley; a play: *The Devils*, by John Whiting; and a film by Ken Russell. All explore the truth of the claim, made in 1836 by Francis Ramadge Hopkins, that, ‘when we are the prey of other disorders the desires are deadened, and lie comparatively dormant; but even in the last stage of consumption, the love of the sex [sic] seems to increase with the decay of the strength.’³⁸ Since we still share in what Ramadge described as the ‘painful interest’ that he took in the affairs of amorous consumptives,³⁹ it is not surprising that the Victorians delighted in the ‘melting love-stories’ that had been decried by Beddoes at the start of the century. Libidinal complications of phthisis were exacerbated by the fact that many victims were young and sensual. Medical and journalistic writers alike urged the necessary supervision of the young and sublimation of their erotic compulsions. Beddoes had laid it down:⁴⁰

[Wasting adolescent girls, cocooned in opulent withdrawing-rooms] ... have well been compared to flowers brought forward by the cherishing heat of the conservatory. They cannot with impunity bear to be roughly visited by the winds of Heaven.

A century later, Sir Thomas Clifford Allbutt, in a retrospective *Study of*

36 T.S. Clouston, ‘Tuberculosis and insanity’, *Journal of Mental Science* 9(1863-64), 57.

37 See for example, William Julius Mickle, ‘Insanity in relation to Phthisis’, *British Medical Journal*, 1(1888), 637-39, 691-93; James Cowles Prichard, *Cyclopaedia*, vol. II, pp. 4-16, 847-75. Prichard sniffs chauvinistically at Esquirol’s suggestion that presenting symptoms may include ‘striking inaptitude in the study of the exact sciences’, suggesting that ‘the last-mentioned particular will scarcely be allowed to constitute a characteristic trait of madness in this country, whatever may be the case in France’ (p. 14). See also: J.C. Bucknill and D.H. Tuke, *A Manual of Psychological Medicine*, 3rd edn (London: Churchill, 1874), passim. See also *Family Physician*, 58(1879), 195 (‘Phthisis is by no means uncommon among the inmates of lunatic asylums’).

38 Francis Ramadge Hopkins FRCP, *Consumption Curable*, 3rd edn (London: Longman, 1836), p.14.

39 *Ibid.*, p. 15.

40 Beddoes, *Essay*, p. 124.

Tuberculosis, commented:⁴¹

I saw more and more of those hot-house plants, like my cousin, and wondered whether the gardeners were stupid, or the houses not hot enough – for they all died! Indeed, no-one ever seemed to suppose that they would get well.

That there were literary influences when Allbutt 'wondered' and 'supposed' is clear from the *Memoir* which he wrote twenty years later and in which he refers perspicaciously to the life, suffering and novels of George Eliot.⁴² Allbutt's contemporary, Thomas Clouston, an eminent phthisiologist and psychiatrist, in his 1906 study *The Hygiene of Mind*, stressed the priestly function of the physician in justifying the ways of science and medicine to morals and metaphysics. Significantly, he took as an exemplar of the archetypal consumption-prone female adolescent Gwendolen Harleth, the heroine of George Eliot's *Daniel Deronda*, linking phthisis to the mismanagement of female puberty.⁴³

It is much worse for a young woman not to have her social instincts ministered to than for a young man ... her cravings are stronger ... her deprivation the more hurtful ... [which] is apt to injure her and to cause nervousness, depression and anaemia ... the bloodlessness now so common in our domestic servants is largely owing to this want of natural family and social life ... adolescents with a nervous heredity or tendency to that thinness that leads to consumption ... may certainly mean hysteria, mental disorders, neurasthenia, or even death.

For Clouston, adolescent insanity took on a phthisical diathesis, which enabled him to air his concerns about miasmata, detoxification and recondi-

41 Thomas Clifford Allbutt, 'The study of tuberculosis: A retrospect', *British Journal of Tuberculosis*, (1907), 5-10.

42 *The Right Honourable Sir Thomas Clifford Allbutt, KCB. A Memoir* (London: Macmillan, 1929). Allbutt himself was reputedly the model for Tertius Lydgate in Eliot's *Middlemarch* and prided himself on his own narrative literary style to such an extent that his examining of Cambridge MB candidates focused on faulty diction at the expense of the thesis, while he admitted to his students at Guy's that he was 'an awful example of talking too much': Thomas Clifford Allbutt, 'Words and Things', *Lancet*, 2(1906), 1120-25.

43 Thomas Clouston, *The Hygiene of Mind* (London: Methuen, 1906), pp.161-62, 171. See also Roy Porter and others, *Nerves and Narratives In Sickness and In Health: The British Experience 1650-1850* (London: Fourth Estate, 1988). For 'Moral Management' see Bucknill and Tuke, *Manual*, pp. 671-72; 'The Cry of the Consumptives', *Nineteenth Century*, (July-Dec 1899), 647. For further examples of the 'fascinating biologising power' of these medico-spiritual gurus see the works of John Conolly, James Cowles Prichard, Charles Locock, and Horatio Donkin, as well as *The Cylopaedia of Practical Medicine and A System of Medicine*, (1896-99) passim, but especially no. 37.

tioning.⁴⁴

Tuberculosis in all its forms is much more common before the age of twenty five ... the age of complete development ... there is a very important and frequent form of insanity ... adolescent insanity which coincides with pulmonary consumption. The general principles of treatment of masturbational insanity [sic] unquestionably [sic] are to brace up the youth bodily, mentally and morally ... the diet should be unstimulating and fattening ... avoid flesh as the incarnation of uncontrollable force, sexual and otherwise ... open air ... hard work ... no day-dreaming.

Such professional perpetuation of the conflicting curse and cachet of consumption was complicated by historical connections with theories, ranging from those of the Greek Hippocrates to those of the Swiss Tissot, concerning pathologies of wasting and venereal diseases, theories which invariably postulated a causal connection. Many of these theories were endorsed by Victorian physicians and psychiatrists, including James Copland, Henry Maudsley and William Acton. They give, for example, haunting accounts of the venereal and phthisical symptoms of their street-walker patients: 'etiolated eye ... blanched chlorotic complexion ... deplorable hectic flush ... sunken eyes.' These case-studies are a litany of marks of Cain which could not be redeemed, much less cured, even under the guise of the 'Traviata Syndrome' through which the psychiatrists portrayed these sexually depraved mad women as though they were haunted Ophelias. Both the Ophelia and Traviata syndromes were well known in the mid-nineteenth century.⁴⁵ A writer in the *Lancet's* 1857 edition on Prostitution castigated certain 'Society Ladies' as 'the daughters of Dives, [who] knowing all about the plot of the "Traviata", visit the opera to witness the apotheosis of a consumptive prostitute, and drive home through the Gehenna fair nightly held in the Haymarket.'⁴⁶ Medical writers were expected to use an elegant literary style and to employ a high moral tone, which is why Henry Maudsley's classical study of *Body and Mind* was specifically sub-titled

44 Thomas Clouston, *Clinical Lectures and Mental Diseases*, 5th edn (London: J. and A. Churchill, 1899), pp. 521, 540-41.

45 For the 'Ophelia' Syndromes see Janet Oppenheim, "*Shattered Nerves*": *Doctors, Patients and Depression in Victorian England* (New York and Oxford: OUP, 1991); Forbes Benignus Winslow, *On Obscure Diseases of the Brain and Disorders of the Mind*, 4th edn (London: John Churchill, 1868), p. 469; Elaine Showalter, *The Female Malady: Women, Madness and English Culture, 1830-1980* (London: Virago, 1987); Susan Sontag, *Illness as Metaphor* (New York: Farrar, Straus, and Giroux, 1978).

46 For the 'Traviata Syndrome', in addition to the above, see Roy Porter and Lesley Hall, *The Facts of Life: The Creation of Sexual Knowledge in Britain, 1650-1950* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1995), pp.129-30.

Specially in Reference to Moral Disorders.⁴⁷ Consequently, Victorian case-studies were more remarkable for the variety than the specificity of symptoms adduced, being wrapped in metaphorical rather than clinical etiologies, but they did furnish to journalists and novelists a readymade and familiar mise-en-scène for them to explore with their readers. Thus, Clouston, profiling a disturbed adolescent patient, selected the following symptoms: the universally recognised 'Spes Phthisica', together with a 'slinking demeanor ... capricious volatility as found in idiocy ... mental brilliancy, short and fitful like the light of an ill-supplied lamp ... irritability ... lassitude ... fancifulness ... fickleness ... unhealthy state of mind ... absurd fancies ... delusions ... causeless changes from hope to despondency ... whims and wanderings of the mind ... ill-nourished brain' All of which were in keeping with the Ophelia Syndrome, which 'when developed becomes insanity.'⁴⁸

In short, there was enough 'materia medica' for any romantic novelist to weave into tales of angst and madness, filling out the characterisations but using the same pool of traits and behaviours to delineate hysterics, imbeciles, phthisical euphorics and manic masturbators. These all exhibited 'incredible vacillation of conduct, indolence, suspicious self-brooding', together with a root pathology of disturbance which appears again and again in the novels as fitfulness: 'Everything is fitful ... fitful energy ... fitful projects ... fitful flights of imagination.'⁴⁹ Hence, it would have come as no surprise to magazine readers of 1879 to be told by Felix Oswald, in *The Remedies of Nature*, that tubercles are: 'tears of poverty and repentance wept inward.'⁵⁰

Romantic novelists made psychological capital out of such moral pronouncements by the physicians because, as Sir James Paget had made clear, consumption is the disease that interplays between 'moral character' and 'health character'.⁵¹ Allbutt, the eminent specialist who had advocated a ban on novel reading in favour of bucolic pursuits for his female 'Traviatas', used language closer to grand guignol than grand opera to describe them: 'Rather blue than sallow ... with limp or clammy hand ... miserable or morose ... shifty or mulish ... hollow-eyed ... like one raised from the dead.'⁵² Similarly, Benjamin Ward

47 Henry Maudsley, *Body and Mind: An Enquiry into their Connection and Influence, Specially in Reference to Moral Disorders* (London: Macmillan, 1871), pp. 84-86, 97-100.

48 Clouston, *Clinical Lectures*, pp. 517-18; 'Tuberculosis and Insanity', *Journal of Mental Science*, 9(1863-64), 57.

49 Maudsley, *Enquiry*.

50 Felix Oswald MD, 'The Remedies of Nature', *Popular Science Monthly*, 23(1883), 11.

51 Paget, *Lectures*, p. 94.

52 *A System of Medicine by Many Writers*, ed. by Thomas Clifford Allbutt and Humphrey Davy

Richardson's sermonising in his *Hygienic treatment of Consumption* would not have been out of place in *East Lynne*.⁵³

I need not particularize the vicious sensual indulgence to which many of humankind habituate themselves. The grosser the sensuality indulged in, the greater is the physical evil resulting from it. Let the consumptive at least bethink themselves what vices affect and prostrate most, and then with strong mind and will give them up altogether ... To those who have charge of the young ... make it their first care to prevent the tendency to sensual debasement.

So too, any of William Acton's self-mutilating, deviant, manic male masturbators could have found a ready place in a Henry James novel, while the language of the phthisis specialist, James Edward Pollock, could have graced the pages of any work by Sir James Paget's close friend, George Eliot. Thus:⁵⁴

The errors of life ... those sins against natural laws, some of which we are all committing with impunity or to destruction ... the over-nursed in close luxurious chambers ... the student over-stepping his powers on an Alpine holiday ... the sorely-taxed governess ... the under-dressed lady undergoing the dangerous excitement of the ball ... prepare the field in which the seeds of death may be sown.

In fact, as a good example of the Victorian medico-literary interface, Pollock's 'sorely-taxed governess, toiling all day and sitting up half the night' closely mirrors the portrayal of Isabel Vane, the delinquent instructress, in *East Lynne*. Again, Milly Theale, the heroine of James' *The Wings of the Dove*, is a fine example of the Victorian Consumptive Sublime.⁵⁵ But there are many more examples of fictional capitalising on the cultural miasmata of phthisis. Eliot and James were the greatest but not the only masters of 'the grand mortuary moment'. John Buchan's eerily disturbing *Sick Heart River*, for example, features an anti-urbanist terminal consumptive, while Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain* is full of lyrical necrophilous evocations of the putrefying though transcendent qualities of tubercular bodies.⁵⁶ Literary reverberations of popular medical texts resonated in the lives of many literate Victorians, and especially in the lives of those 'career invalids' who took as role models women like Florence Nightingale, Alice James (sister of Henry and William) and Mrs

Continued ...

Rolleston, 9 vols (London: Macmillan, 1896-99), viii, 140.

53 Benjamin Ward Richardson, *The Hygienic Treatment of Consumption*, p. 94.

54 Pollock, *Prognosis*, pp. 336-37.

55 Henry James, *The Wings of The Dove* (New York: Scribner, 1909).

56 John Buchan, *Sick Heart River* (repr. Oxford: OUP, 1994); Thomas Mann, *The Magic Mountain*, trans. (repr. London: Minerva, 1996).

Henry Wood, women of whom it was said at the time that they 'took to their chaises longues as a military leader to his command post.'

Mrs Henry Wood, the pen-name of Ellen Price, composed the sensation-novel *East Lynne* which was hugely popular, especially with women who identified with its analysis of psycho-sexual neuroses, female sexual urges and subversively carnal fantasies. They revelled also in its intricate speculations about temptation and jealousy, sin and redemption, repentance and salvation, retribution and curse. These issues burgeoned within the context of lives haunted by the threat and promise of that *spes phthisica* which was at the heart of so much Victorian female angst. It is largely due to the persistent popularity of fictional heroines like the renegade wife of *East Lynne* that the paradoxical paradigms of consumption have continued into the twenty-first century.⁵⁷ Isabel Vane's demise, in transcendent, hedonistic, phthisical rapture, together with that of her 'bright' but congenitally 'delicate' son, was tearfully agonised over in homes, as well as in salons, across the land.⁵⁸

Readers similarly agonised over the death of Dickens' Little Nell, or that of Silas K Hocking's Little Nellie.⁵⁹ For nineteenth-century readers, the emotional metastases were all too familiar from the writings of the medical moralisers, as in this passage from *East Lynne*.

[Isabel] was looking very ill ... her features were white and attenuated ... her sweet sad eyes had grown larger and darker ... her hands were hot and sticky ... the symptoms of sinful happiness throbbing at her heart spoke plainly of the expediency of withdrawing entirely ... from dangerous sophistries.

Meanwhile her 'brilliant hectic son' breathed his last, believing that,⁶⁰

There will be the beautiful city with its gate of pearls ... shining precious stones ... streets of gold ... the clear river ... trees with their fruits and their healing leaves ... harps and music.

Having been tutored by the literary physicians, the genteel readers of 1890 would readily have accepted, as death-bed romance, the devotional absurdity that a dying seven-year-old could express lyrical longings which showed him to be completely au fait with the apocalyptic promises of the Book of Revelation.

In many Victorian homes, and most salons, there were books of 'dan-

57 Mrs Henry Wood, *East Lynne* (repr. Stroud, Glos: Sutton, 1993), p. 335.

58 *Ibid.*, p. 570.

59 Silas K. Hocking, *Her Benny* (1879; repr. Liverpool: Gallery Press, 1968).

60 Mrs Henry Wood, *East Lynne*, pp. 659, 677.

gerous sophistries', side by side with romantic novels, popular periodicals and manuals of devotion. '*Lectio Divina*' formed an essential part of Victorian moral formation. Among texts considered suitable for such meditative reading, in addition to the Bible, would have been Bunyan's *Pilgrims Progress*, Foxe's *Book of Martyrs* and Thomas a Kempis' *Imitation of Christ*. But they might also have included (in translation) Francis de Sales' *Introduction to the Devout Life* and significantly, towards the end of the century, the *Story of a Soul*. Significantly, because this spiritual autobiography of St Teresa was written by a French Carmelite nun, an archetypal phthisical virgin victim who herself became an icon, her death from tuberculosis, aged twenty-four, being soon followed by a cult, by canonisation, by a published hagiography and by international fame, under a nickname which would have suited Milly Theale and many other romantic heroines, namely 'The Little Flower'. Almost all of these devotional works are still bestsellers, world-wide, in dozens of languages.

And yet, no amount of saccharine romancing by the doctors, or of the pieties of the novelists like Mrs Wood, could for long effectively hide the horrors of the plague of consumption. Mrs Wood's 1863 necromantic tale *The Shadow of Ashlydyat*, with its clinical discussions about 'wasting ... atrophy ... mental anguish ... tonics ... and lingering death foreshadowed by spectral bier ... gradual wasting away of the system without apparent cause', was still reflecting both the curse-with-cachet mythology associated with tuberculosis and the piety of the Bona Mors: 'This most favoured death ... time is given me to set my house in order.'⁶¹ Such stoical fictional death-bed heroism reflects what Pat Jalland, in *Death in the Victorian Family*, has called the 'Death of the Chosen'.⁶²

The doctors, however, were continuing to detect – behind the mystifying manifestations of the wasting pathologies – hereditary and generational factors through which they could assure, though certainly not re-assure, their patients that they were paying the wages of sin. In the mid-nineteenth century, Edward Smith wrote in the *British Medical Journal* that 'the causes of phthisis are engrafted into the habits and vices of both high and low ... we add to this fundamental evil the one which is more powerful than any other ... viz ... the defective states of system which the parent communicates to the child from the action of these adverse influences through many generations.'⁶³ This arcane, moralising, etiological intensity was copied by novelists like Charlotte Yonge, whose prolific and popular output included *The Trial*, a sequel to the *Daisy*

61 Mrs Henry Wood, *The Shadow of Ashlydyat* (repr. Stroud, Glos: Sutton, 1994) pp. 394-95, 459-60.

62 Pat Jalland, *Death in the Victorian Family* (Oxford: OUP, 1996).

63 Edward Smith, *British Medical Journal*, (1857), 70.

Chain of 1864, in which the leading characters were doctors. They fought over a familiar battle-ground, arguing as to 'whether the enemy had travelled by infection, or was the product of miasma.'⁶⁴ In a highly-charged atmosphere of aestheticised decay, the consumptive heroine played out her role as gynaecological icon of female grace:⁶⁵

gathering breath ... she sought him with her eager eyes, shining large, lustrous and wilful ... out of the thin white face where the once glowing languid voice ... transparently white blue-veined skin ... lovely roseate tint ... [all consummating in] a really fatal disorder ... [redeemed by the cachet of] a sofa life ... [throbbing with *spes phthisica*].

By the end of the century the romance was fading as the horrors grew. The *Spectator* warned starkly that⁶⁶

no scheme of inoculation will banish scrofula ... or that strange hereditary tendency to die early which is the despair of so many physicians, marks so many families, and has given rise to so many legends about inherited curses and vicarious punishments for blasphemies or other sins.

The doctors and 'Agony Aunts' who write in today's magazines about AIDS and chlamidia, or anorexia and bulimia, still tend to incarnate in fashionable diseases the evils of society itself, just as Clouston, Maudsley, Allbutt and their contemporaries did with phthisis. These commentators used this mysterious affliction as a living metaphor for all the social, moral and spiritual ills of the age, including hysteria, monomania, neurasthenia and hypochondria. Indeed, they created a veritable *bildungsroman* of the Sin-Society-Sickness nexus, in order to include all the psycho-sexual totems and taboos of their century. Their publications interfaced with those of the fiction writers in the narration of the etiologies of societal corruption and decay.⁶⁷

Nowadays, we expect our books to be more clearly categorised as to

64 Charlotte Yonge, *The Trial* (repr. Stroud, Glos: Sutton, 1996), p. 9.

65 *Ibid.*, pp. 353, 365. Tom May, a physician like his father, plays Svengali to Averil's Trilby.

66 *Spectator*, 1890.

67 See Sander Gilman, *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race and Madness* (London and Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985); Thomas Cifford Allbutt, 'Nervous diseases and modern life', *Contemporary Review*, 67(Jan-June 1885), 210-31 (and especially p. 21 and pp. 217-18); George Frederick Drinka, *The Birth of Neurosis: Myth, Malady, and the Victorians* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1984); William Greenslade, *Degeneration, Culture and the Novel 1880-1940* (Cambridge: CUP, 1994); Karl Beckson, *London in the 1890s: A Cultural History* (New York and London: Norton, 1992); Penelope Murray, *Genius: The History of an Idea* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1989).

their genre and target audience. In the nineteenth century cultural boundaries were blurred. Members of the professions doubled up as writers, while authors spiced up their texts with an inter-larding of sophisticated insights from the emerging sciences. Some highly qualified doctors and scientists were also well-respected authors. Henry James's brother William, for example, who was a physician, philosopher, psychologist and author, laced his treatises, such as *The Varieties of Religious Experience* with the flowery prose of popular fiction. At the same time, his novelist brother was weaving into the tapestry of his dramatic romances the threads of ideas gleaned from science, religion, philosophy and psychosomatic medicine.⁶⁸ Similarly, Sir Arthur Conan Doyle became increasingly frustrated at being treated as a writer of detective yarns, rather than as a doctor who was pioneering research into the paranormal and the occult.⁶⁹ That the reputation of Henry James should have travelled better down the corridors of fame than that of his multi-talented, pragmatic physician brother William, should no more surprise us than that the story-teller in Conan Doyle should have out-survived the pseudo-scientist. After all, Daniel Defoe wrote hundreds of social and political tracts, only to be immortalised by a tale which has captivated generations of children who could never have had the slightest interest in the South Sea Bubble.

The literary interface between doctors and writers persisted into the twentieth century, via such varied authors as A.J. Cronin, Alex Comfort, Blake Morrison and James Le Fanu.⁷⁰ Even the erotic mystique associated with phthisis did not entirely disappear from the literature. In 1926, D.G. Macleod Munro affirmed that,⁷¹

68 William James, *Varieties of Religious Experience* (New York: Random House, 1902).

69 See Michael Shepherd, *Sherlock Holmes and the Case of Doctor Freud* (London and New York: Tavistock, 1985).

70 A.J. Cronin, *Adventures in Two Worlds* (London: Gollanz, 1952); Alex Comfort, *The Joy of Sex* (London: Quartet, 1996), and *The Anxiety Makers: Some Curious Sexual Preoccupations of the Medical Profession* (London: Panther, 1968); Blake Morrison, *And When Did You Last See Your Father?* (London: Granta, 1993); James Le Fanu, *The Rise and Fall of Modern Medicine* (London: Little Brown, 1999).

71 D.G. MacLeod Munro, *The Psycho-pathology of Tuberculosis* (London: Humphrey Milford, 1926), p. 33.

It is well-known that in the case of persons of a dreamy and introspective temperament, but who are otherwise healthy, there is usually more indulgence in erotic thought, and sometimes in actual sexual excess, than in those of a more active and virile disposition. When individuals of this type are attacked by tuberculosis, a disease in which a sense of languor and dreaminess are often prominent features, it is not unreasonable to expect to find an increase in sexual feeling.

The narrative and dramatic potential of such theories is also continuing to be teased out in the pages of best-selling novelists, such as Frank McCourt and J.G. Farrell.⁷² It also features in mass-circulation newspapers and journals.⁷³ No doubt the twenty-first century will develop its own medico-literary interfaces to rival those of the past. In the twenty-first century, the main focus of medico-literary attention will be on genetic and auto-immune-deficiency disorders. Modern melodramas of 'diseases of civilisation', played out on the electronic media, will perhaps replace the bourgeois dramas of the nineteenth century dealing with sick-and-death-bed consumptives, real or fictional. But the ravages of tuberculosis will continue to fascinate health professionals and haunt the general public.

The medical, moral, psychological, religious and social implications and ramifications of infirmity are perennial topics for debate and research. *Spes phthisica* will remain a part of that debate for the foreseeable future. As Denis de Rougement prophesied in memorably lyrical Victorian purple prose:⁷⁴

Eros may still be magniloquent or plaintive, but the tropes of passionate discourse and the hues of its rhetoric can never become more than the glow of a resurgent twilight and the promise of a phantom bliss.

72 Frank McCourt, *Angela's Ashes: A Memoir of Childhood* (London: Flamingo, 1997), especially p. 378; J.G. Farrell, *The Siege of Krishnapur* (London: Phoenix, 1973) and *The Hill Station* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1981), especially p. 61.

73 See, for example, Jack O'Sullivan, 'Scourge of the Brontes returns', *Independent*, 21 January 1997, p. 12; Anne Griffiths-Jones, 'Tuberculosis in homeless people', *Nursing Times*, (26 February 1997), 60; Diana Appleyard, 'Could we be on the verge of a modern T.B. plague?', *Daily Mail*, 29 September 1998, p. 42; J. Bradbury, 'WHO awareness of countries failing fight against T.B.', *Lancet*, (1998), 351; Rowan Moore, 'First there was a small spot of blood, then a flood', *Evening Standard*, 14 July 1998, p.30.

74 Cited in M.C. D'Arcy, *The Mind and Heart of Love* (London and Glasgow: Fontana, 1962), p.49.